



Woollahra Local Planning Panel (Electronic Meeting)

Tuesday 13 December 2022
at the Conclusion of Public Meeting

Agenda

Meeting to be held using conferencing technology

Item No: D1
Subject: **PLANNING PROPOSAL - PLACES OF PUBLIC WORSHIP - HERITAGE STUDY**
Author: Shona Lindsay, Senior Heritage Officer
Approvers: Anne White, Manager - Strategic Planning & Place
Scott Pedder, Director - Planning & Place
File No: 22/204818
Purpose of the Report: To seek the advice of the Woollahra Local Planning Panel in relation to a planning proposal to list five places of worship as local heritage items in Schedule 5 and on the Heritage Map of the Woollahra Local Environmental Plan 2014.
To seek the advice of the Woollahra Local Planning Panel in relation to the nomination of the Sydney Chevra Kadisha at 172-178 Oxford Street, Woollahra to the State Heritage Register.
Alignment to Delivery Program: Strategy 4.2 Conserving our rich and diverse heritage.

Recommendation:

- A. THAT the Woollahra Local Planning Panel advises Council to proceed with the planning proposal to list the following sites as local heritage items in Schedule 5 and on the Heritage Map of the Woollahra Local Environmental Plan 2014:
- i. Paddington Church of Christ, including interiors and moveable heritage at 116-122 Paddington Street, Paddington (Lot 20, 21 & 22, Sec 1, DP 180)
 - ii. St Andrews Scots Presbyterian Church, including interiors and moveable heritage at 2 Carlisle Street, Rose Bay (Lot 1 DP 724928 & Lot 1 DP 966535)
 - iii. St George Greek Orthodox Church and war memorial, including interiors and moveable heritage at 90-92 Newcastle Street, Rose Bay (Lots 15 & 16, Sec D, DP5092)
 - iv. Sydney Chevra Kadisha, including interiors and moveable heritage at 172-178 Oxford Street, Woollahra (Lot 1 DP 85862)
 - v. Vacluse Uniting Church site - former 1909 Vacluse Congregational Church building and former 1960 A-frame church building, including interiors and moveable heritage at 3 Russell Street, Vacluse (Lot 6, Sec 5, DP 4400)
- B. THAT the Woollahra Local Planning Panel provides advice to Council to proceed with the nomination to the State Heritage Register of Sydney Chevra Kadisha, including interiors and moveable heritage at 172-178 Oxford Street, Woollahra (Lot 1 DP 85862)

Executive Summary:

The purpose of this report is to seek the advice of the Woollahra Local Planning Panel (Woollahra LPP) on the listing of the following sites as local heritage items in Schedule 5 and on the Heritage map of the *Woollahra local Environmental Plan 2014* (Woollahra LEP 2014):

- i. Paddington Church of Christ, including interiors and moveable heritage at 116-122 Paddington Street, Paddington (Lot 20, 21 & 22, Sec 1, DP 180)
- ii. St Andrews Scots Presbyterian Church, including interiors and moveable heritage at 2 Carlisle Street, Rose Bay (Lot 1 DP 724928 & Lot 1 DP 966535)
- iii. St George Greek Orthodox Church and war memorial, including interiors and moveable heritage at 90-92 Newcastle Street, Rose Bay (Lots 15 & 16, Sec D, DP5092)
- iv. Sydney Chevra Kadisha, including interiors and moveable heritage at 172-178 Oxford Street, Woollahra (Lot 1 DP 85862)
- v. Vacluse Uniting Church site - former 1909 Vacluse Congregational Church building and former 1960 A-frame church building, including interiors and moveable heritage at 3 Russell Street, Vacluse (Lot 6, Sec 5, DP 4400)

We recommend that the Woollahra LPP provides advice to Council to proceed with the planning proposal at **Attachment 2**.

Council staff are also seeking feedback from the Woollahra LPP on the proposed nomination to the State Heritage Register (SHR) of Sydney Chevra Kadisha, including interiors and moveable heritage at 172-178 Oxford Street, Woollahra (Lot 1 DP 85862)

Discussion:

Reason for report to the Woollahra Local Planning Panel

On 27 September 2018, the Minister for Planning issued a Local Planning Panel Direction – Planning Proposals:

- A Council to whom this direction applies is required to refer all planning proposals to be prepared after 1 June 2018 to the local planning panel for advice, unless the council's general manager determines that the planning proposal relates to:
 - a) the correction of an obvious error in a local environmental plan
 - b) matters that are of a consequential, transitional, machinery or other minor nature, or
 - c) matters that council's general manager considers will not have any significant adverse impact on the environment or adjoining land.
- When a planning proposal is referred to the panel, it must be accompanied by an assessment report prepared by council staff setting out recommendations, including whether or not the planning proposal should proceed
- A proposal is to be referred to the local planning panel before it is forwarded to the Minister under section 3.34 of the *Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979* (the EP&A Act).

In this case, the planning proposal is required to be referred to the Woollahra LPP because the General Manager has not made a determination in regard to items 1 (a), (b) or (c), above.

Background

On 8 April 2019 Woollahra Council resolved (in part):

(Item 11.3)

THAT Council:

- B. Requests staff to commission a report to investigate potential heritage significance of places of worship in the Woollahra Local Government area in order to identify items of heritage significance at either a local or State level, with a view to having those identified items listed as:*
- (a) a local heritage item in the Woollahra Local Environmental Plan 2014 (WLEP); and/or*
 - (b) an item on the State Heritage Register under the Heritage Act 1977.*

And at the same meeting Council also resolved (in part):

(Item 11.2)

THAT Council requests staff to undertake an assessment of heritage significance for the following properties located in Rose Bay, NSW:

- i) St Andrews Scots Presbyterian Church, corner Dover Rd and Carlisle Street, Rose Bay;*

and report to the Environmental Planning Committee on whether these items have sufficient heritage significance to be listed as:

- i) a local heritage item in the Woollahra Local Environmental Plan 2014 (WLEP); and/or*
- ii) an item on the State Heritage Register under the Heritage Act 1977.*

Progressing the heritage study

There are a total of 27 places of worship in the Woollahra LGA. Eighteen of the 27 places of worship are already locally heritage listed in Schedule 5 of the Woollahra LEP 2014 and one is also listed on the State Heritage Register (SHR).

The potential heritage significance of the remaining nine unlisted places of worship was investigated as part of this heritage study.

The nine unlisted places of worship within the Woollahra LGA are provided in the attached report *Heritage Study: Places of Worship, Woollahra LGA* (**Attachment 1**).

Assessments of heritage significance

An assessment of heritage significance for each of the nine sites was carried out by Council's Senior Heritage Officer Shona Lindsay and Heritage Officer Charlotte Simons, in accordance with the document titled *Assessing heritage significance*, published by the NSW Heritage Office in 2001 and *Investigating Heritage Significance 2021* published by Heritage NSW.

All sites have been assessed against the seven NSW heritage criteria. Each criterion has inclusions and exclusions guidelines which are used to assist in the assessment process. If an item meets one of the seven heritage criteria at a local level, and retains the integrity of its key attributes, it can be considered to have local heritage significance.

Table 1: NSW Heritage assessment criteria summary

Criteria		
(a)	Historic significance	<i>An item is important in the course, or pattern, of NSW's cultural or natural history (or the cultural or natural history of the local area)</i>
(b)	Historical association significance	<i>An item has strong or special association with the life or works of a person, or group of persons, of importance in NSW's cultural or natural history (or the cultural or natural history of the local area)</i>
(c)	Aesthetic significance	<i>An item is important in demonstrating aesthetic characteristics and/or a high degree of creative or technical achievement in NSW (or the local area)</i>
(d)	Social significance	<i>An item has strong or special association with a particular community or cultural group in NSW (or the local area) for social, cultural or spiritual reasons</i>
(e)	Technical significance/research potential	<i>An item has potential to yield information that will contribute to an understanding of NSW's cultural or natural history (or the cultural or natural history of the local area)</i>
(f)	Rarity	<i>An item possesses uncommon, rare or endangered aspects of NSW's cultural or natural history (or the cultural or natural history of the local area)</i>
(g)	Representativeness	<i>An item is important in demonstrating the principal characteristics of a class of NSW's</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><i>cultural or natural places; or</i><i>cultural or natural environments.</i><i>or a class of the local area's</i><i>cultural or natural places; or</i><i>cultural or natural environments.</i>

To be assessed for State significance, an item will meet more than one of the seven heritage criteria at a State level, or if an item satisfies only one of the criteria, the item is of such particular significance to NSW that it should be listed.

Having assessed each of the sites against the Heritage NSW guidelines, it was concluded that five of the sites meet the threshold for listing as items of local heritage significance. A summary of each Heritage NSW criteria, and how these were met by each site is summarised below in **Table 2**.

Table 2: NSW Heritage criteria assessment summary (Local significance)

Property	(a) historic	(b) association	(c) aesthetic	(d) social	(e) technical/ research	(f) rarity	(g) representative
Paddington Church of Christ	✓	✓	✓	✓	✗	✓	✓
St Andrews Scots Presbyterian Church	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
St George Greek Orthodox Church and war memorial	✓	✓	✓	✓	✗	✓	✓
Sydney Chevra Kadisha	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Vaucluse Uniting Church Site	✓	✗	✓	✓	✗	✓	✓

At Sydney Chevra Kadisha it was concluded that based on the comparative analysis and established heritage, the building also meets the heritage criteria at the State level as summarised in **Table 3** below:

Table 3: NSW Heritage criteria assessment summary (State Significance)

Property	(a) historic	(b) association	(c) aesthetic	(d) social	(e) technical/ research	(f) rarity	(g) representative
Sydney Chevra Kadisha	✓ State	✓ State	✓ Local	✓ State	✓ State	✓ State	✓ Local

The sites

The five sites that are the subject of this report are spread across the municipality, and are summarised below.

Paddington Church of Christ



Figure 1: Front elevation of the Paddington Church of Christ

The Paddington Church of Christ (at 116-122 Paddington Street) is located on the northern side of Paddington Street, Paddington. The church was erected in 1901 and designed by architect Walter Sydney Newman in the Romanesque Revival style and is of face brick construction.

The symmetrical two-storey church building is constructed of face brick with a parapeted gable roof that is clad with terracotta tiles, which in turn are capped by terracotta ridge ornaments. The exterior of the church building's design is defined by engaged brick piers and decorative dichromatic brickwork comprising string courses and soldier courses to fenestration. Characteristic of the church's Romanesque Revival style, fenestration is relatively small in relation to the wall area. The windows at street level are of rectangular amber leaded glass design, while fenestration at the lower basement level comprises timber framed double hung sash windows.

St Andrews Scots Presbyterian Church



Figure 2: Western elevation of the church



Figure 3: Internal View of the Stained Glass Window

St Andrews Scots Presbyterian Church at 2 Carlisle Street, Rose Bay, was constructed in 1913 in the Federation gothic style by builders Messers. D. McRae and Son. It has a steeply pitched roof and is constructed with sandstone footings, brown face brick walls, timber rafters, hammer beam roof internally and slate roof externally.

The exterior of the Church has sandstone footings, brown face brick walls and a slate roof. The windows are of cast concrete and are of a lancet style with filigree decoration, and the walls have a string course above and below the windows. The doors are made from timber. The roof has exposed rafter eaves. There is a low sandstone fence on the street boundaries.

St George Greek Orthodox Church



Figure 4: Front elevation



Figure 5 Templon (Source: parish website)

Constructed in 1962, at 90-92 Newcastle Street, Rose Bay, the St George Greek Orthodox Church is an example of a late twentieth century ecclesiastical style church. It was designed by architects Fowell, Mansfield & Maclurcan and built by Cirvan Bros Pty Ltd. Dedicated as a war memorial, the church fronts Newcastle Street as a combination of the classic Greek Orthodox church style merged with elements of the simplified Byzantine style that is typical of Australian war memorial architecture. The building is set back from the street and sides, and is elevated on a tiered podium to the front.

Sydney Chevra Kadish



Figure 6: 1950s photograph of the Sydney Chevra Kadish

Constructed between 1949 and 1952 at 172-178 Oxford Street, Woollahra, the Sydney Chevra Kadisha building is a Post-war Modernist style building designed by prominent architect Samuel Lipson of Lipson and Kaad Architecture as a mortuary chapel for the Sydney Jewish community.

While the building retains characteristics of its style, this Modernist place of worship incorporates shapes, motifs and elements that specifically refer to traditional Orthodox Synagogue design. The building is situated on an unusual wedge shaped site between two roads and is on a north to south gradient. The building's northern elevation contains lower ground levels facing Wallis Street and the southern elevation comprises the main ground level facing Oxford Street.

Vaucluse Uniting Church



Figure 7: Vaucluse Uniting Church



Figure 8: Decorative mural paintings to walls within the 1909 church building drawn by Pixie O'Harris in 1961

The site of the Vaucluse Uniting Church, at 3 Russell Street, Vaucluse, comprises two former church buildings. The original 1909 church building is located at the rear southern end of the site. The northern end of the site with street frontage to Russell Street is occupied by the 1960 A-frame church building, which was designed by Booker & Wilson Architects. The original 1909 building located at the rear of the site is not readily visible from the surrounding streetscape and is largely obscured by the 1960 church building. The original church is no longer used as a place of worship and has been used as a childcare facility since the 1960s. The 1960s A-frame church ceased being used as a church in 2020.

Planning Proposal

Consistent with the recommendations of the report *Heritage Study: Places of Worship, Woollahra LGA*, a planning proposal (see **Attachment 2**) has been prepared to list the following sites as local heritage items in Schedule 5 and on the Heritage Map of the Woollahra LEP 2014:

- *Paddington Church of Christ, including interiors and moveable heritage at 116-122 Paddington Street, Paddington (Lot 20, 21 & 22, Sec 1, DP 180)*
- *St Andrews Scots Presbyterian Church, including interiors and moveable heritage at 2 Carlisle Street, Rose Bay (Lot 1 DP 724928 & Lot 1 DP 966535)*
- *St George Greek Orthodox Church and war memorial, including interiors and moveable heritage at 90-92 Newcastle Street, Rose Bay (Lots 15 & 16, Sec D, DP5092)*
- *Sydney Chevra Kadisha, including interiors and moveable heritage at 172-178 Oxford Street, Woollahra (Lot 1 DP 85862)*
- *Vaucluse Uniting Church site - former 1909 Vaucluse Congregational Church building and former 1960 A-frame church building, including interiors and moveable heritage at 3 Russell Street, Vaucluse (Lot 6, Sec 5, DP 4400)*

The planning proposal has been prepared in accordance with section 3.33 of the EP&A Act and the document prepared by the NSW Department of Planning and Environment titled *Local Environmental Plan Making Guideline* (December 2021).

The planning proposal satisfies the requirements of section 3.33 of the EP&A Act as it includes:

- A statement of the objectives or intended outcome of the amendment to Woollahra LEP 2014.
- An explanation of the provisions that are to be included in the amendment to Woollahra LEP 2014.
- The justification for the objectives, outcomes and provisions and the process for their implementation.
- Details of the community consultation that is to be undertaken.

The objective of the planning proposal is to recognise the heritage significance of the above listed sites as local heritage items and provide them with statutory heritage protection. Heritage listing aims to provide the sites with ongoing protection and recognition of the heritage significance of the sites.

Relationship to the strategic planning framework

The planning proposal has strategic and site specific merit. The planning proposal is consistent with the relevant objectives of *Greater Sydney Region Plan: A Metropolis of Three Cities* (2018) and the actions of the *Eastern City District Plan* (2018).

The planning proposal is consistent with the Council's Community Strategic Plan titled *Our Woollahra 2030: Our community, our place, our plan*. Notably, the planning proposal meets the following strategy within Goal 4 (Well-planned neighbourhood) under the theme Quality places and spaces:

- *4.3 Protect local heritage, including significant architecture and the natural environment.*

The planning proposal is also consistent with the Woollahra Local Strategic Planning Statement (approved by Council on 24 February 2020). In particular, the planning proposal is consistent with Planning Priority 5 under the theme of Liveability:

- *Planning Priority 5 Conserving our rich and diverse heritage.*

The planning proposal is consistent with the *Standard Instrument – Principal Local Environmental Plan* and all other applicable State environmental planning policies and applicable section 9.1 directions.

Options:

As a consequence of this report, the Woollahra LPP may provide advice to Council to proceed with a planning proposal to list five sites as local heritage items in the Woollahra LEP 2014.

Alternatively, the Woollahra LPP may resolve not to support the preparation of a planning proposal or require staff to make amendments.

Any person or organisation can nominate a place or object believed to be of state significance for listing on the State Heritage Register. Nominations are made by completing the SHR nomination form. The Woollahra LPP may also choose to provide advice to Council with regards to the nomination to list Sydney Chevra Kadisha at 172-178 Oxford Street, Woollahra on the SHR under the *Heritage Act, 1977*.

Community Engagement and / or Internal Consultation:

Following the finalisation of the draft heritage inventory sheets, Council staff engaged with all property owners of the proposed heritage listed properties and a chronology of consultation is included at **Attachment 3**.

In summary:

Paddington Church of Christ

A representative of the owner of the Paddington Church of Christ engaged GBA Heritage to prepare a submission. This submission supports the proposed local heritage listing and provides recommendations to update the Heritage Inventory Sheet (see **Attachment 4**).

The Heritage Study and Heritage Inventory Sheet have been updated to reflect the additional historical information provided in the submission and adopts some of the recommended changes. These changes are identified with track changes in **Attachment 5**.

However, key changes where Council staff did not supporting amending the Heritage Inventory Sheet are summarised below:

Issue raised in submission

The church does not have landmark qualities

The moveable heritage items indicate the original use of the Church building but are not intrinsic to the significance of the subject site and are representative of Church items associated with religious services.

Response from staff

Council staff do not agree, and consider that the following elements facilitate this place of worship as a landmark building which sets it apart from the residential streetscape:

- Generous side setbacks,
- Building is constructed on two lots
- The face brick materiality.

Council staff do not agree.

The study found that the moveable heritage items are of significance to the Church. Council staff support the preparation of a moveable heritage strategy which would further inform the management of these items. For a building of this scale and function, it is appropriate to recognise the importance of the moveable items to its significance and operation.

St Andrews Scots Presbyterian Church

A representative of the owner of St Andrews Scots Presbyterian Church contacted staff indicating that a submission would be lodged. At the time of preparing this report, the submission had not been received.

St George Greek Orthodox Church and war memorial

A representative of the owner of the St George Greek Orthodox Church engaged Urbis to prepare a submission. This submission does not support the proposed local heritage listing (see **Attachment 4**).

According to Urbis, the church and war memorial is:

- A 'pedestrian example' of Post-War Ecclesiastical architecture,
- Not a fine or representative example of the work of Fowell, Mansfield and Maclurcan
- Not directly associated with a significant Greek settlement or cultural centre, and does not have historical importance. The submission further states that the war memorial is not associated or celebrated further with special services on ANZAC Day or Remembrance Day.

Whilst the submission does state the church may have social significance to its community, the report is undetermined if this social significance is linked to the fabric of the building. It recommends that community engagement is undertaken to determine the potential social significance.

The submission concludes that there is no justification for the proposed heritage listing due to it not meeting the Heritage NSW criteria. In response, Council staff assert that the heritage study was prepared in accordance with the documents titled *Assessing heritage significance*, published by the NSW Heritage Office in 2001 and *Investigating Heritage Significance 2021* published by Heritage NSW in 2021.

This property has been identified as meeting the following heritage criteria:

- ✓ Criterion (a): Historical significance
- ✓ Criterion (b): Associative significance
- ✓ Criterion (c): Aesthetic/technical significance
- ✓ Criterion (d): Social significance
- ✓ Criterion (f): Rarity
- ✓ Criterion (g): Representative

The St George Greek Orthodox Church and war memorial has local historical significance for its ability to reflect the rapid pattern of development of Rose Bay in the post-World War I era and the growing presence of migrant communities that settled in the area during this time.

The Church is significant for its association with migrant communities that settled in NSW following World War I. Since its construction and consecration, the church building has been the focus for worship and the continuity and celebration of Greek customs and traditions in Sydney's Eastern suburbs.

The St George Greek Orthodox Church has significance for its associations with Australia's defence history. The church is dedicated as a war memorial that provides a place of commemoration for Australian soldiers of Greek heritage who lost their lives in World War I and World War II, and also Australian soldiers who lost their lives in Greece during World War II. The church is listed on the NSW War Memorials Register.

Designed by prominent Inter-War architectural firm Fowell, Mansfield & Maclurcan, the St George Greek Orthodox Church is considered to be a fine and representative example of their ecclesiastical buildings. The church building is an interesting example of a Greek Orthodox War Memorial Church, which combines elements of the Byzantine style typically associated with ANZAC memorials with the traditional Greek Orthodox Church style. The church displays simple and restrained design elements of these styles, whilst also stylistically consistent with the work of Fowell, Mansfield & Maclurcan. Within its surrounding streetscape setting, the church has landmark qualities.

Although social significance has not been established from members of the parish community, it is assumed the St George Greek Orthodox Church is held in high esteem by members of the Parish and the broader Greek Orthodox community of Sydney. In addition to regular Sunday church services, the building has been a focal point for the local Greek Orthodox community for significant celebrations and events including weddings, baptisms, funerals and religious activities for more than five decades providing an important part in the community's sense of place.

The St George Greek Orthodox Church is the only example of its type in the Municipality. While there are numerous Greek Orthodox churches in Sydney and NSW, the St George Greek Orthodox Church has rarity as one of a very small number of churches of its type – being a Greek Orthodox war memorial church. There is only one other known Greek Orthodox war memorial church remaining in Sydney, the St Spyridon Greek Orthodox War Memorial Church, which is listed as a local heritage item on the Randwick Local Environmental Plan 2012. The only other being the St Ioannis Greek Orthodox War Memorial Church dating to 1965 has since been demolished. The loss of this comparable building type increases the rarity of the St George Greek Orthodox Church.

Council staff retain their recommendation that the St George Greek Orthodox Church meets the threshold for local heritage listed.

Sydney Chevra Kadisha

A representative of the owner of the Sydney Chevra Kadisha engaged Urbis to prepare a submission. This submission supports the proposed local heritage listing and provides recommendations to update the Heritage Inventory Sheet in regards to the recommended management of the proposed heritage item and around the removal of the c.1981 western wing which has previously been approved for removal (see **Attachment 4**).

The submission recommends that State Heritage Listing should not be pursued until a more detailed heritage assessment of the building, including significance mapping and a moveable heritage schedule have been completed.

Council staff concur that significance mapping as part of a Conservation Management Plan and a moveable heritage schedule are appropriate management tools for the proposed heritage item. However, due to the demonstrated significance of this building in NSW, this should not prevent the nomination of the building to the NSW to the State Heritage Register.

The Heritage Study and Heritage Inventory Sheet have been updated to reflect the recommendations made in the submission and the changes to the Heritage Inventory Sheet are identified with track changes at **Attachment 5**.

Vaucluse Uniting Church Site

A representative of the owner of the former Vaucluse Uniting Church engaged Patrick Wilson of Touring the Past to prepare a submission. This submission generally supports the proposed local heritage listing with proposed amendments (see **Attachment 4**).

The Heritage Study and Heritage Inventory Sheet have been updated to reflect the additional historical information provided in the submission and adopts some of the recommended changes. The changes to the Heritage Inventory Sheet are identified with track changes in **Attachment 5**.

However, key changes where Council staff did not supporting amending the Heritage Inventory Sheet are summarised below:

Issue raised in submission

Only specific interior elements of the A-frame church should be listed

Listing the 'old' church building is not strong. The loss of its façade, combined with the unsympathetic relationship established between it, the A-frame Church, and the public realm in 1960, has negated any potential heritage value

The 'old' church retains some fine architectural elements, namely its coloured glazing, copper bell-cote, leadlighting/coloured glazing, and Pixie O'Harris murals.

Response from staff

Including all interiors allows the protection of the entire interior of the church which is deemed to be significant as per Council's heritage study. This is an appropriate and robust approach to heritage conservation in accordance with the Burra Charter.

The former 1909 church has significance as part of the overall site and the heritage inventory statement reflects this. To reach the threshold only one criterion has to be met. The former 1901 church has historical and social significance.

Whilst it is noted that the submission is recommending that the 'old' church building is not included as part of the listing, contradictory information contained in the submission highlights that it contains elements of significance. Accordingly, Council staff retain the

Issue raised in submission	Response from staff
<p>The A-frame church does not meet the threshold for aesthetic (C) and social (D) significance.</p>	<p>recommendation that the local heritage listing includes the 'old' 1909 church.</p> <p>The Heritage Study used the Heritage Manual criteria and found that the church meets both the aesthetic and social significance criteria as summarised below:</p> <p><i>Aesthetic significance:</i> The A-frame church building is a restrained late twentieth century ecclesiastical building. The building has been subject to few alterations and additions since its construction. A-frame churches were designed and built for their striking spatial qualities, and the building is considered to be aesthetically distinctive.</p> <p><i>Social significance:</i> Although social significance was not formally studied for this assessment, it is noted Vaucluse Uniting Church likely has social significance as a centre of worship for the local community for more than a century. The Vaucluse Uniting Church is a place of community memory. The A-frame church building on the site contains memorials and plaques to commemorate individuals associated with the church over time.</p> <p>Notwithstanding, to qualify for local heritage listing in accordance with the guidelines, the building is only required to meet one of the criteria.</p>
<p>The extent of the heritage listing should only be applied to the footprint of the A-frame Church and the frontage of the subject property, therefore excluding the rear half of the place, which contains the flat-roofed link and 'old' modified church.</p>	<p>It is agreed that the flat-roofed link is not significant. However, the former 1901 church was found to reach the threshold for heritage significance as per the Heritage Study. Heritage Management Documents would provide further guidance on the management of all the buildings with significance on the site.</p>
<p>The Heritage Inventory Sheet should be revised to reflect that the 1960 'link' element is completely unremarkable, and the defaced 'old' church, including its interiors, should be identified as not significant or at least of less significance than the A-frame Church building</p>	<p>It is agreed the flat-roofed link is not significant. However, the former 1901 church was found to reach the threshold for historical and social significance as per the Heritage Study.</p>

In response to issues raised in the submissions, the Heritage Inventory Sheets have been updated and these are attached at **Attachment 5** with changes identified with track changes. The Heritage Study has also been updated and this is at **Attachment 1**.

No other community engagement has been undertaken to date. Public exhibition of the planning proposal will be undertaken in due course, and in accordance with the Gateway determination conditions and the Act, should the planning proposal be endorsed for public exhibition.

Policy Implications:

Should Council resolve to progress a planning proposal (having considered the advice of the Woollahra LPP), and should the planning proposal progress to finalisation, there will be policy implications by listing five sites as local heritage items in the Woollahra LEP 2014.

Financial Implications:

NIL

Resourcing Implications:

Staff resources will be associated with progressing a planning proposal which will include managing the public exhibition and preparing a post exhibition report to a meeting of Council. Staff resource implications will also be associated with progressing a nomination to the SHR.

Conclusion:

This report seeks the advice of the Woollahra LPP on a planning proposal to list five places of worship as local heritage items in Schedule 5 and on the Heritage Map of the Woollahra LEP 2014.

The planning proposal satisfies the requirements of section 3.33 of the EP& A Act as it includes:

- A statement of the objectives or intended outcome of the amendment to Woollahra LEP 2014.
- An explanation of the provisions that are to be included in the amendment to Woollahra LEP 2014.
- The justification for the objectives, outcomes and provisions and the process for their implementation.
- Details of the community consultation that is to be undertaken.

We recommend that the Woollahra LPP provides advice to Council to proceed with the planning proposal at **Attachment 2** to list the subject sites as local heritage items in the Woollahra LEP 2014.

Staff also seek the advice of the Woollahra LPP in relation to the nomination to list Sydney Chevra Kadisha at 172-178 Oxford Street, Woollahra as a property on the SHR under the *Heritage Act, 1977*.

Attachments

1. Heritage Study - Places of Worship, Woollahra LGA - November 2022 (amended) (Heritage Inventory Sheets separately attached)
2. Planning Proposal - Places of Worship in Woollahra
3. Chronology of consultation with the owners
4. Submissions from property owners
5. Heritage Inventory Sheets - amended with track changes